Assalamu 'Alaikum Wa Rahmatul Lah Wa Barakatuhu.

Thank you for going through my humble write-up and the wonderful observation you made.

The "other book" you made reference to and even made screen shots of I believe is ALMIRATH by Salah-Uddin Bin Haider Ali Lakhvi.

Your observation was that Rule Z ought to be applicable for *Muqasama* only. I revisited my write-up and compared notes with ALMIRATH. I observed that Rule Z is somewhat ambiguous and that was what led to your observation. Therefore, Rule Z as it is, is applicable when Grandfather is inheriting with a combination of FULL BROTHERS and consanguine siblings (in the presence or absence of other heirs). Kindly check ALMIRATH:

1. Page 95 (both examples). Note that in the first example, 1/3 of the estate is better for the Grandfather while in the second, *Muqasama* is better.
2. Page 96 (example 1). Here, 1/3 and *Muqasama* are equal for Grandfather.
3. Page 97 (example 1). *Muqasama* is better for Grandfather.
4. Page 99 (both examples).

We know that the maximum share of a full sister is ½ while two or more full sisters get 2/3 of the estate maximum. So, if they are inheriting along with Grandfather and consanguine siblings (in the presence or absence of other heirs), using Rule Z, when the consanguine siblings surrender their shares to the full sister(s), they CANNOT inherit/be entitled to more than ½ or 2/3 of the estate as the case may be. Meaning that, anything above ½ or 2/3 will be given back to the consanguine siblings to share. Kindly check ALMIRATH

1. Page 98 (example 2). Note that if Grandfather were to inherit 1/3 of the residue, full sister should have gotten 10/18 which is more than ½ if Rule Z were applied. But she has to make do with 9/18 and surrender the remaining 1/18 to the Half Brother. Similar thing applies if Grandfather should consider taking 1/6 of the estate. Nevertheless, *Muqasama* is better for the Grandfather.

This does not mean that Rule Z is used for *Muqasama* only. The point to note is that FULL SISTER is involved, not Full Brother. Hence, there can be situations

whereby Rule Z is applied for the three options of Grandfather's inheritance. Examples 44 and 45 in my book show that. In both cases, Full Sisters get 2/3 of the estate (applying Rule Z).

To this end, your observation has prompted me to revise Rule Z as follows:

When the surviving heirs of a deceased are:

1. **Grandfather and any combination of full brother(s), consanguine brother(s) and/or consanguine sister(s) in the presence or absence of other heirs, the "consanguines" ACT or BEHAVE as if they were "fulls." When grandfather takes his portion of the estate, the full brother(s) exclude the consanguine(s) thereby inheriting his/her/their share(s).**
2. **Grandfather and any combination of full brother(s), full sister(s), consanguine brother(s) and/or consanguine sister(s) in the presence or absence of other heirs, the "consanguines" ACT or BEHAVE as if they were "fulls." When grandfather takes his portion of the estate, the "full" siblings exclude their consanguine counterparts thereby sharing the residue among themselves.**
3. **Grandfather and any combination of full sister(s), consanguine brother(s) and/or consanguine sister(s) in the presence or absence of other heirs, the "consanguines" ACT or BEHAVE as if they were "fulls." When grandfather takes his portion of the estate, the full sister(s) take over the shares of the "consanguine(s)" provided it does not exceed ½ or 2/3 of the estate (for single full sister and two or more full sisters respectively). The reminder (if any) is shared by the "consanguine(s)."**

Applying the updated Rule Z (which will be included in the second edition of the printed book and also uploaded on the website soon In Shaa Allah), my solutions (b) and (c) for Example 48 are wrong because full sister gets 10/18 (0.56) in (b) which is more than ½ and 5/18 (0.28) which is less than ½ in (c).

Your suggested solution for (b) is correct because full sister gets 18/36 or ½ of the estate at the end of the day. However, your solution for (c) – *Muqasama* is wrong for the reason that she inherits 25/42 or 0.60 of the estate which is more than her

maximum share of ½. Thus, the correct solution if Grandfather were to accept the *Muqasama* option *Wallahu A'lam* is as follows:

c) *Muqasama*

~~Grandfather acts as full brother. As a result, consanguine brothers are excluded.~~

Heirs	Mother	Full sister	Grandfather	2 Consanguine brothers
Shares	1/6	Residue		
Base number	6			
Portions	1	5		
New base number	42			
New portions	7	5	10	20
Final portions	7	21	10	Each = 2
Values	0.17	0.5	0.24	Each = 0.05

In order to illustrate the application of the first and second parts of the updated Rule Z, I decided to add two more examples.

Example 49: Daughter, Grandfather, 2 full brothers and consanguine sister

a) 1/6 of the estate

Heirs	Daughter	Grandfather	2 Full brothers	Consanguine sister
Shares	½	1/6	Residue	
Base number	6			
Portions	3	1	2	
New base number	30			
New portions	15	5	Each = 4	2
Final portions	15	5	Each = 5	"Excluded"
Values	0.5	0.17	Each = 0.17	0

b) 1/3 of residue

Heirs	Daughter	Grandfather	2 Full brothers	Consanguine sister
Shares	½	Residue		
Base number	2			
Portions	1	1		
New base number	14			
New portions	7	7		
Newest base number	42			
Newest portions	21	7	Each = 7	"Excluded"
Values	0.5	0.17	Each = 0.17	0

With base number of 14, 1/3 of the residue (7) cannot be determined without reminder.

c) *Muqasama*

Heirs	Daughter	Grandfather	2 Full brothers	Consanguine sister
Shares	½	Residue		
Base number	2			
Portions	1	1		
New base number	14			
New portions	7	2	4	1
Newest base number	28			
Newest portions	14	4	8	2
Final portions	14	4	Each = 5	"Excluded"
Values	0.5	0.14	Each = 0.18	0

Note that using 14 as base number, the estate can be shared. But applying Rule Z, when the consanguine sister surrenders her portion to the two full brothers, their total portions become 5 which they cannot share without reminder. That necessitated doubling the base number (using the number of "heads" of full brother's category that cannot share their portion). So, Grandfather may choose either 1/6 of the estate or 1/3 of the residue.

Example 50: 2 wives, grandfather, full brother, full sister, consanguine brother, consanguine sister

a) 1/6 of the estate

Heirs	2 Wives	Grandfather	Full brother	Full sister	Consanguine brother	Consanguine sister
Shares	¼	1/6	Residue			
Base number	12					
Portions	3	2	7			
New base number	72					
New portions	18	12	14	7	14	7
Final portions	Each = 9	12	28	14	"Excluded"	"Excluded"
Values	Each = 0.125	0.17	0.39	0.19	0	0

b) 1/3 of residue

Heirs	2 Wives	Grandfather	Full brother	Full sister	Consanguine brother	Consanguine sister
Shares	¼	Residue				
Base number	4					
Portions	1	1	2			
New base number	24					
New portions	6	6	4	2	4	2
Final portions	Each = 3	6	28	4	"Excluded"	"Excluded"
Values	Each = 0.125	0.25	0.33	0.17	0	0

c) *Muqasama*

Heirs	2 Wives	Grandfather	Full brother	Full sister	Consanguine brother	Consanguine sister
Shares	¼	Residue				
Base number	4					
Portions	1	3				
New base number	32					
New portions	8	6	6	3	6	3
Final portions	Each = 4	6	12	6	0	0
Values	Each = 0.125	0.19	0.38	0.19	0	0